EXHIBIT A

NESBITT INCORPORATING MOLITOR '637 (OR ALTERNATIVELY IN COMBINATION WITH MOLITOR '637)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. <i>See</i> (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 244:12—244:17 (Ex. 16).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (<i>See</i> Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1.)
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 244:12—244:17 (Ex. 16).)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
said inner cover layer having a thickness of 0.100 to 0.010 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.) Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).) Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (See CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches, and	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.) "The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A multi-layer golf-ball	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
comprising:	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	"[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I. DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	"[A] center or core 12 is molded with a layer of hard, high modulus Surlyn resin , such as Surlyn type 1605" (Nesbitt, col. 3, lines 27-29.)
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information:
	Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605 (see '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66 (See id. at Table 1).
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.
said inner cover layer	Surlyn® 1605 is a low acid ionomeric resin:
comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (Surlyn® 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin". ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-58.)
and having a modulus of from	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (<i>See</i> CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 of comparatively soft, low flexural modulus resinous material is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14 " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
	"[T]he outer layer or cover 16 being of dimpled configuration " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 48-49; Fig. 2.)
said outer layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including "polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates"; specifically Estane 58133 thermoplastic polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col. 18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)

Case 1:06-cv-00091-SLR Document 231-1 Filed 08/14/07 Page 7 of 178 PageID #: 6026 Invalidity Charts for U.S. Patent No. 6,210,293

Claim 5	Nesbitt
A golf ball according to claim 4	See above.
wherein said inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
and said outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt, col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
said golf ball having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt, col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

NESBITT AND WU

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
	"The present invention relates to golf balls " (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 1, line 5.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
	Conventionally, golf balls are made by molding a cover about a core" (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 1, lines 15-16.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt, col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605 (<i>see</i> '293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66 (<i>see id</i> at Table 1.)
	ON THE BALL Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 244:12—244:17 (Ex. 16.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1.)
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 244:12—244:17. Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
said inner cover layer having a thickness of 0.100 to 0.010 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637, col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.) Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. (Id. at col 8, lines 20-21.) Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).) Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (See Response to
an outer cover layer having	Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.) "An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10),col.
	2, lines 43-47.) "The present invention relates to polyurethane covered golf balls." (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 1, lines 6-7.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).
	<u>Wu</u>
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches, and	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Wu
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8) Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
menes of more.	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
A multi-layer golf-ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
	"The present invention relates to golf balls " (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 1, line 5.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
	Conventionally, golf balls are made by molding a cover about a core" (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 1, lines 15-16.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
a Shore D hardness of 60 or	"[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus
more molded over said	resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn ® marketed by E.I.
spherical core	DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	"[A] center or core 12 is molded with a layer of hard, high modulus Surlyn resin , such as Surlyn type 1605" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 27-29.) OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information:
	Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605) (<i>see</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than
	plaque measurements and would also be above 60. Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 244:12—244:17.
said inner cover layer	Surlyn® 1605 is a low acid ionomeric resin:
comprising an ionomeric resin	Per the '293 Patent:
including no more than 16%	"Type 1605 Surlyn® (Surlyn® 8940) is a sodium ion based low
by weight of alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid	acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin". ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-58.)
unsaturated carboxyric acid	1011011161 168111 (293 patent (Ex. 1), coi. 2, tines 34-38.)
and having a modulus of from	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then
	remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
	"The present invention relates to polyurethane covered golf balls." (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 1, lines 6-7.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	<u>Wu</u>
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)
disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 of comparatively soft, low flexural modulus resinous material is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14 " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
	"[T]he outer layer or cover 16 being of dimpled configuration " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 48-49; Fig. 2.)
	"In the final molding step, a compression mold is used to impart a dimple patter upon the cover" (Wu (Ex. 8), col. 5, lines 32-34.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
said outer layer comprising a	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference:
polyurethane based material.	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of
	Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which
	describes a number of foamable compositions of a character
	which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16."
	(Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including
	"polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic
	polyisocyanates"; specifically Estane 58133 thermoplastic
	polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col.
	18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)
	Wu
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a
	polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8) Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll.
	35; claim 1.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball according to claim 4	See above.
wherein said inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
and said outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
said golf ball having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

NESBIT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
	"This invention relates to golf balls" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 1, line 11.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
	Conventional solid cores are typically compression molded from a slug of uncured or lightly cured elastomer composition" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 5, lines 44-47.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
	"The phrase "two-piece ball" as used herein also includes balls having a separate solid layer beneath the cover as disclosed, for example, in U.S. Pat. No. 4,431,193 to Nesbitt, and other balls having non-wound cores." (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 7-12.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55.) OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information:
	Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605 (<i>see</i> '293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66 (<i>see id.</i> at Table 1.)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1.)
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of 0.100 to 0.010 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
	Molitor '751 Molitor '751 teaches blends comprising Surlyn 1605 (8940), Surlyn 1706 (9910). (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), Table 1.) Each of these materials is less than 16% acid (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt	and Molitor '751		
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)			
	Nesbitt Referen	Incorporates the Materials	of Molitor '6	37 by
	"Refere P. Moli number employe	nce is made to the application tor issued into U.S. Pat. Not of foamable compositions of ed for layers 16 for the (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.	4,274,637 wh a character when golf ball of this	ich describes a hich may be
	and 17. material	''637: Teaches the use of Es (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Esta that has a Shore D hardnes W 00615792 (Ex. 46).)	ne is a soft po	lyurethane
	cover la	neasured on the ball of Nesb yer has a Shore D hardness of at ¶ 33).		
	Molitor	· '751:		
		ON THE B.		
		'751 discloses the following b), col. 7, line 25, Table):	blend as the m	ost preferred
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
		neasured on Nesbitt's ball, the s of hardness of 49.6. (Mack	Knight Decl. (E	
	OFF THE BALL When measured off the ball, this formulation had a Shore D hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" average Shore D hardness AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)			
		17		

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches, and	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)
porjuremane material.	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A multi-layer golf-ball	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
comprising:	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere ." (Nesbitt, col. 2, lines 31- 34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
a Shore D hardness of 60 or	"[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus
more molded over said	resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn ® marketed by E.I.
spherical core	DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	"[A] center or core 12 is molded with a layer of hard, high
	modulus Surlyn resin, such as Surlyn type 1605" (Nesbitt
	(Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 27-29.)
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information:
	Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605) (see '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2,
	lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1),
	Table 1.)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than
	plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (See Nesbitt
	Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer	Surlyn® 1605 is a low acid ionomeric resin:
comprising an ionomeric resin	Per the '293 Patent:
including no more than 16% by	"Type 1605 Surlyn® (Surlyn® 8940) is a sodium ion based low
weight of alpha, beta-	acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid)
unsaturated carboxylic acid	ionomer resin" ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-58.)
11	
and having a modulus of from	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
about 15,000 to about 70,000	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low
psi	acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid)
	ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi. "
	('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then
	remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10),
	col. 2, lines 43-47.)
	Molitor '751:
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a
	thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col.
	3, lines 6-7.)
a Shore D hardness of about 64	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn®
or less	1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 .
	(CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of
	reference is made to the approximation per 110, 123,030 01

Claim 4	Nesbitt	and Molitor '751		
	Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which			
	describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of			
	this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)			
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples			
	16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft			
	1 0	polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55		
	measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)			
	When m	neasured on the ball of Nesbitt Mo	olitor '637's outer	
		yer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0). (MacKnight Decl.	el.
	, ,	at ¶ 33).		
	Molitor			
	Molitor	ON THE BALL '751 discloses the following blend	los the most	
		d (col. 7, line 25, Table):	i as the most	
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
	When measured on Nesbitt's ball, this cover has a Shore D hardness of hardness of 49.6 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).			
	OFF THE BALL			
	When measured off the ball, this formulation had a Shore D hardness of 39.5 (<i>See</i> "Texin Blend" average Shore D hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)			
disposed about said inner cover		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	ckness of 0.0575	
layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)			
layer golf ball				

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
said outer layer comprising a	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference:
polyurethane based material.	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of
	Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which
	describes a number of foamable compositions of a character
	which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16."
	(Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including
	"polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic
	polyisocyanates"; specifically Estane 58133 thermoplastic
	polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col.
	18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)
	Molitor '751:
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a
	thermoplastic polyurethane " (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col.
	3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball according to claim 4	See above.
wherein said inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
and said outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
said golf ball having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '637

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)	
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."	
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.	
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex.	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of 0.100 to 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.)
	"The preferred dimensions are and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6
resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
alpha, beta-unsaturated	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
carboxylic acid; and	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex.) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
said outer cover layer	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637
having a thickness of 0.010	about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of
to 0.070 inches, and	1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer
	thickness of 0.0525 inch" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-
	46.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane
	material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 2	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637
A multi-layer golf-ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
carboxylic acid	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-
	unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi	"The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.)
	"Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc) " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner I (Parts by We	
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%
		22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural 0512231 (Ex. 45), while Surlyn of 48,000 psi (<i>Id</i> .)
an outer cover layer having		Iterial such as balata or a blend of Proudfit (Ex. 5), (col. 5, lines 15-
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less " an outer layer of soft material such balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit 17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of le Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesl at 121:2—121:5.).		(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-dness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of
	the Proudfit patent (See CW 0	Ball, which is made according to 302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC
	and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18	se of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 B.) Estane is a soft polyurethane ardness of 55 as measured "off x. 46).)
	ON T	THE BALL
	When measured on the ball o	f Proudfit Molitor '637's outer dness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl.

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637
disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball	Fig. 1 [plurality of dimples Proudf (Ex. 5), Fig 1.]
said outer layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '637
A golf ball according to claim 4	See above.
wherein said inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.)
	"The preferred dimensions are an inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
and said outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
said golf ball having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)

PROUDFIT AND WU

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu	
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)	
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."	
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.	
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex.	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu
	5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of 0.100 to 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.) "The preferred dimensions are and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer resins containing no more	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6
than 16% by weight of an	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
carboxylic acid; and	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	<u>Wu</u>
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56.8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu
	MDI prepolymer.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches, and	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Proudfit (Ex. 5), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 2	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575
inches or more.	inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu
A multi-layer golf-ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7,

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu
	lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231.) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
resin including no more than 16% by weight of	TABLE 6
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
carboxylic acid	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi	"The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.)
	"Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc) " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu	
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described."	ed in Table
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 ha modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45), while 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id</i> .)	
an outer cover layer having	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, 17.)	
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5 17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (S Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Tranat 121:2—121:5.).	, lines 15- See Decl. of
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made act the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) ha hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (0131413 (Ex. 34).) Wu	s a Shore D
	ON THE BALL	
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 who measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 3)	
	OFF THE BALL	·
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 6 60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) she measurements of MDI prepolymer.)	60:14— when

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu
disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball	Fig. 1 [plurality of dimples Proudf (Ex. 5) Fig. 1]]
said outer layer comprising polyurethane.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15- 17.) <u>Wu</u> Wy discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8) Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Wu
A golf ball according to claim 4	See above.
wherein said inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.)
	"The preferred dimensions are an inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
and said outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
said golf ball having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231.) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34.)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of 0.100 to 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.) "The preferred dimensions are and inner layer thickness of
	0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
resins containing no more	TABLE 6
than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
carboxylic acid; and	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.)
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).) Molitor '751:
	ON THE BALL
	Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred ((Ex. 13), col. 7, line 25, Table):

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751			
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
	When measured on Proudfit's ball, this cover has a Shore D hardness of hardness of 49.6. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).			3).
	hardnes	OFF THE BALL neasured off the ball, this formulating of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" averated 1414 (Ex. 34).)	on had a Shore D	at
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches, and	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)			
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)			
	_	eferred components of the cover molastic polyurethane " (Molito	-	,

Claim 2	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein said golf ball has an	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and
overall diameter of 1.680	inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575

Claim 2	Proudfit and Molitor '751
inches or more.	inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball
	diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751		
A multi-layer golf-ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)		
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)		
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)		
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)		
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."		
r	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover		
	(Parts by Weight)		
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%		
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)		
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231.) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)		
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:		
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.		
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,		

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit
	(Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of alpha, beta-unsaturated	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
carboxylic acid	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer
	resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi	"The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.) "Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner
	layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc) " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>)
an outer cover layer having	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of
	balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751		
	the Protof less t	ON THE BAL	7) has a Shore D hardness all. (See AC 0131413.)
	Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred (Ex. 13), col. 7, line 25, Table):		
		Material	Parts
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10
		TiO2	5
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10
		Antioxidant	0.17
		Pigment	0.02
		Release Agent	1
	When measured on Proudfit's ball, this cover has a Shore D hardness of hardness of 49.6. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).		
	hardnes	of THE BAL neasured off the ball, this formul s of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" ave 1414 (Ex. 34).)	ation had a Shore D

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751
disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball	Fig. 1 [[plurality of dimples Proudf] (Ex. 5) Fig. 1]]
said outer layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '751:
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3,
	lines 6-7.)

Claim 5	Proudfit	
A golf ball according to claim 4	See above.	
wherein said inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.)	
	"The preferred dimensions are an inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)	
and said outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)	
said golf ball having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)	

EXHIBIT B

PROUDFIT

Claim 1	Proudfit		
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)		
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)		
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)		
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)		
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."		
	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover		
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio		
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%		
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)		
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)		
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:		
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.		
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)		

Claim 1	Proudfit
	This cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> Decl. Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25), ¶¶ 8-9.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
or more low acid ionomer resins containing no more	TABLE 6
than 16% by weight of an	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
carboxyne acid, and	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polymeric material selected from the group consisting of non-ionomeric thermoplastic and thermosetting elastomers.	"A golf ball cover in accordance with the invention includes an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers. Preferably, the outer layer is a blend of balata and a thermally crosslinkable elastomer such as polybutadiene. The balata and elastomer are crosslinked during the molding of the ball by a crosslinker such as zinc diacrylate and a crosslinking initiator such as organic peroxide rather than using the conventional sulfur and RR2 crystals curing system for balata covers. The outer layer of the cover is completely crosslinked when the ball is removed from the mold, and subsequent processing steps can be performed in the same manner as on Surlyn covered balls." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5,

Claim 1	Proudfit
	lines 17-27.)

Claim 2	Proudfit
A golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein the inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.)
	"The preferred dimensions are an inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
and the outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
the golf ball having the properties required by the U.S.G.A. and having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of 1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch (inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680 inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '637

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637
A golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein the outer layer comprises a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '637				
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)				
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.) "Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)				
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)				
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6				
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)				
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)				
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)				

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '637				
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:				
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is				
	conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core. 2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,				
	compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex.				
	5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)				
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."				
resin comprising no more than 16% by weight of an	TABLE 6				
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)				
carboxylic acid	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)				
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi;	D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.)				
	"Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc) " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)				
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."				
	TABLE 6				
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover				
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>) (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>) (col. 8, lines 22-30.) Therefore, the cover will inherently have a				
	flexural modulus between 15,000 psi and 70,000 psi.				
an outer cover layer having	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of				

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
molded over said spherical intermediate ball to form a multi-layer golf ball	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
the outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

PROUDFIT AND WU

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu
A golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein the outer layer comprises a polyurethane material.	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Wu			
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)			
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)			
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)			
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)			
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said	"The composition of the inner cove 6."	er layer is described in Table		
spherical core	TABLE	E 6		
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)			
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio		
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%		
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30			
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardne			
	Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512			
	cover blend has a hardness of 60 or	more when measured off the		

Claim 5	Proudfit and Wu				
	ball, specifically 64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 Ex. 34).)				
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:				
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is				
	conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.				
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,				
	compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)				
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."				
resin comprising no more than 16% by weight of an	TABLE 6				
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)				
carboxylic acid	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)				
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi;	D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.)				
	"Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc) " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)				
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."				
	TABLE 6				
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover				
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%				
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231(Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>)				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural				
	modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn				
	9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>)				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Therefore, the cover will				

Claim 5	Proudfit and Wu				
	inherently have a flexural modulus between 15,000 psi and 70,000 psi.				
an outer cover layer having	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)				
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).				
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)				
	Wu				
	ON THE BALL				
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56.8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)				
	OFF THE BALL				
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)				
molded over said spherical intermediate ball to form a multi-layer golf ball	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)				
the outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)				
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex.8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)				

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751
A golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein the outer layer comprises a polyurethane material.	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '751			
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)			
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)			
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)			
an inner cover layer having	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)			
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said	"The composition of the inner cove 6."	er layer is described in Table		
spherical core	TABLE	E 6		
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)			
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio		
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%		
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30			
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardne			
	Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512			
	cover blend has a hardness of 60 or	more when measured off the		

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '751				
	ball, specifically 64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)				
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:				
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is				
	conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core				
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,				
	compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)				
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."				
resin comprising no more than 16% by weight of an	TABLE 6				
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)				
carboxylic acid	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)				
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi;	D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.)				
	"Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)				
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."				
	TABLE 6				
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover				
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio				
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%				
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id</i> .)				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural				
	modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn				
	9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>)				
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Therefore, the cover will				

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '751				
	inherently have a flexural modulus between 15,000 psi and 70,000 psi.				
an outer cover layer having	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)				
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.). The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0121412 (Ex. 24))				
	013141	3 (Ex. 34).)			
	Molitor	<u>· '751:</u>			
		ON THE BALL			
		Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 7, line 25, Table):			
		Material	Parts		
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90		
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10		
		TiO2	5		
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10		
		Antioxidant	0.17		
		Pigment	0.02		
		Release Agent	1		
		neasured on Proudfit's ball, this is of hardness of 49.6 . (MacKn			

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	OFF THE BALL When measured off the ball, this formulation had a Shore D hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" average Shore D hardness at AC 0131414 (ex. 34).)
molded over said spherical intermediate ball to form a multi-layer golf ball	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
the outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Molitor '751:
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

NESBITT INCORPORATING MOLITOR '637 (OR ALTERNATIVELY IN COMBINATION WITH MOLITOR '637)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Monitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1).
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or	OFF THE BALL
less molded on said inner cover layer,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex.

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polymeric material selected from the group consisting of non-ionomeric thermoplastic and thermosetting elastomers.	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: "(1) vinyl resins formed by the polymerization of vinyl chloride or by the copolymerization of vinyl chloride with unsaturated polymerizable compounds, e.g., vinyl esters; (2) polyolefins such as polyethylene, polypropylene, polybutylene, transpolyisoprene, and the like, including copolymers of polyolefins; (3) polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates; (4) polyamides such as polyhexamethylene; (5) polystyrene, high impact polystyrene,
	styrene acrylonitrile copolymer and ABS, which is acrylonitrile, butadiene styrene copolymer; (6) acrylic resins as exemplified by the copolymers of methylmethacrylate, acrylonitrile, and styrene, etc.; (7) thermoplastic rubbers such as the urethanes, copolymers of ethylene and propylene, and transpolyisoprene, block copolymers of styrene and cispolybutadiene, etc.; and (8) polyphenylene oxide resins , or a blend with high impact polystyrene known by the trade name "Noryl." (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 34-51.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball according to claim 1	See above.
wherein the inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.070 inches	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
and the outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
the golf ball having the properties required by the U.S.G.A. and having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.) "This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein the outer layer comprises a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
spherical core	by E.I DuPont de Nemours ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL DuPont Surlyn® Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 24).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1.)
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin comprising no more	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi;	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus. "Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner play or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or	OFF THE BALL
less	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (ex. 1), col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
molded over said spherical intermediate ball to form a multi-layer golf ball	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 of comparatively soft, low flexural modulus resinous material is then re-molded onto the inner ply or layer 14 " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
the outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including "polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates"; specifically teaches Estane 58133 thermoplastic polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col. 18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)

NESBITT AND WU

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL DuPont Surlyn® Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1).
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 .
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).
	<u>Wu</u>
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polymeric material selected from the group consisting of non-ionomeric thermoplastic and thermosetting elastomer.	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: "(1) vinyl resins formed by the polymerization of vinyl chloride or by the copolymerization of vinyl chloride with unsaturated polymerizable compounds, e.g., vinyl esters; (2) polyolefins such as polyethylene, polypropylene, polybutylene, transpolyisoprene, and the like, including copolymers of

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
	polyolefins; (3) polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates; (4) polyamides such as polyhexamethylene; (5) polystyrene , high impact polystyrene, styrene acrylonitrile copolymer and ABS, which is acrylonitrile, butadiene styrene copolymer; (6) acrylic resins as exemplified by the copolymers of methylmethacrylate, acrylonitrile, and styrene, etc.; (7) thermoplastic rubbers such as the urethanes, copolymers of ethylene and propylene, and transpolyisoprene, block copolymers of styrene and cispolybutadiene, etc.; and (8) polyphenylene oxide resins , or a blend with high impact polystyrene known by the trade name "Noryl." (Molitor '637 (ex. 12), col. 5, lines 34-51.)
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball according to claim 1	See above.
wherein the inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.070 inches	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
and the outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
the golf ball having the properties required by the U.S.G.A. and having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball according to claim	See above.

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
1,	
wherein the outer layer comprises a polyurethane material.	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Wu
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Wu
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1).
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin comprising no more	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
and having a modulus of	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Wu
from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi;	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi. " ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner play or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or	OFF THE BALL
less	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (ex. 1), col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Wu ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)
molded over said spherical intermediate ball to form a multi-layer golf ball	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 of comparatively soft, low flexural modulus resinous material is then re-molded onto the inner ply or layer 14 " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Wu
the outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

NESBITT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded on said core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL DuPont Surlyn® Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1).
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
	Molitor '751 Molitor '751 teaches blends comprising Surlyn 1605 (8940), Surlyn 1706 (9910). (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), Table 1.) Each of these materials is less than 16% acid (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col.

Claim 1	Nesbitt	and Molitor '751		
	2, lines 43-47.)			
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less molded on said inner cover layer,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 .			
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by			
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)			
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)			a soft
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).			
	Molitor			
		'751 discloses the following r '751 (Ex. 13), col. 7, line 25	blend as the m	nost preferred
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
		neasured on Nesbitt's ball, the s of hardness of 49.6. (Mack		

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	OFF THE BALL When measured off the ball, this formulation had a Shore D hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" average Shore D hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
said outer cover layer comprising a relatively soft polymeric material selected from the group consisting of non-ionomeric thermoplastic and thermosetting elastomers.	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: "(1) vinyl resins formed by the polymerization of vinyl chloride or by the copolymerization of vinyl chloride with unsaturated polymerizable compounds, e.g., vinyl esters; (2) polyolefins such as polyethylene, polypropylene, polybutylene, transpolyisoprene, and the like, including copolymers of polyolefins; (3) polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates; (4) polyamides such as polyhexamethylene; (5) polystyrene, high impact polystyrene, styrene acrylonitrile copolymer and ABS, which is acrylonitrile, butadiene styrene copolymer; (6) acrylic resins as exemplified by the copolymers of methylmethacrylate, acrylonitrile, and styrene, etc.; (7) thermoplastic rubbers such as the urethanes, copolymers of ethylene and propylene, and transpolyisoprene, block copolymers of styrene and cispolybutadiene, etc.; and (8) polyphenylene oxide resins, or a blend with high impact polystyrene known by the trade name "Noryl." (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 34-51.) Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball according to claim 1	See above.
wherein the inner cover layer has a thickness of about 0.100 to about 0.070 inches	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
and the outer cover layer has a thickness of about 0.010 to	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
about 0.010 inches,	range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
the golf ball having the properties required by the U.S.G.A. and having an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more.	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.) "This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball according to claim 1,	See above.
wherein the outer layer comprises a polyurethane material.	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
a Shore D hardness of 60 or more molded over said spherical core	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751		
	OFF THE BALL DuPont Surlyn® Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent, Table 1.)		
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:		
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)		
	ON THE BALL		
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)		
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:		
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12) Table 1).		
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)		
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:		
resin comprising no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)		
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn		

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 at 16 (Ex. 28).)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi;	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus. "Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner play or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
a Shore D hardness of 64 or less	OFF THE BALL Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '751:
	ON THE BALL
	Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751			
	(Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 7, line 25, Table):			
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
	When mardnes	neasured on Nesbitt's ball, this is of hardness of 49.6. (MacK OFF THE B) neasured off the ball, this form is of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" 1414 (Ex. 34).)	Enight Decl. (E ALL nulation had a	Ex. 30) at ¶ 33). Shore D
molded over said spherical intermediate ball to form a multi-layer golf ball	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 of comparatively soft, low flexural modulus resinous material is then re-molded onto the inner ply or layer 14 " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)			
the outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material.	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)			

EXHIBIT C

NESBITT INCORPORATING MOLITOR '637 (OR ALTERNATIVELY IN COMBINATION WITH MOLITOR '637)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. <i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
more low acid ionomer resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and,	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
actu, unu,	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent, col. 2 (Ex. 1), lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637	
	patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)	
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)	
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)	
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)	
said outer cover layer having	OFF THE BALL	
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)	
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by	
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)	
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)	
	ON THE BALL	
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)	
a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)	
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575	

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10, col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane
polyurethane material.	material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.05	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to about	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.06 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core:	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf
	ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a
	solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like
	material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2,
	lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer,
about said core,	lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural
	modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines
	34-37.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn® Product Information : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1; "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomeric resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a "relatively soft polyurethane material." (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	OFF THE BALL
	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55. (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 6	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.05	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 7	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to about 0.06	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 8	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core:	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 60 or more,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn® Product Information : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)

Claim 8	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer	Surlyn® 1605 is a low acid ionomeric resin.
comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, betaunsaturated carboxylic acid	Per the '156 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (Surlyn® 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin". ('156 patent (Ex. 3), col. 2, lines 46-51.) Methacrylic acid is an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus. "Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer disposed about said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 9	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	OFF THE BALL Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55. (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)

Claim 9	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 10	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.05	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 11	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to about 0.06	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

NESBITT AND WU

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn® Product Information : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
more low acid ionomer resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and,	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
acia, ana,	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having	OFF THE BALL
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane (Table 1) has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. at (Ex. 30) ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer blend.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.05 inches.	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.) "The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to about	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.06 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core:	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf
	ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a
	solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like
	material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2,
	lines 31-34.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
an inner cover layer disposed about said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Wu
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomeric resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col.
	16, line 34.) Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a "relatively soft polyurethane material." (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Wu Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a
	polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	OFF THE BALL Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of
	55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 46).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	Wu
	ON THE BALL Wu's polyurethane (Table 1) has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (See
	AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)

Claim 6	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
has a thickness of from about	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.01 to about 0.05 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 7	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
has a thickness of from about	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.03 to about 0.06 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 8	Nesbitt and Wu	
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)	
a core:	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)	
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 60 or more,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)	
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)	
	OFF THE BALL DuPont Surlyn® Product Information: Surlyn® 8940	
	(formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent Ex. 1), Table 1.)	

Claim 8	Nesbitt and Wu
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric	Surlyn® 1605 is a low acid ionomeric resin.
resin including no more than	Per the '156 Patent:
16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	"Type 1605 Surlyn® (Surlyn® 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin". ('156 patent (Ex. 3), col. 2, lines 46-51.) Methacrylic acid is an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.
and having a modulus of	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer disposed about said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)
	<u>Wu</u>
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 12), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 10	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.05 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)

Claim 10	Nesbitt and Wu
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 11	Nesbitt and Wu
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
about 0.06 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

NESBIT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751	
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)	
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)	
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)	
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)	
	OFF THE BALL	
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)	
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by	
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)	
	ON THE BALL	
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. <i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)	
said inner cover layer	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by	
comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and,	Reference: Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)	
, and,	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)	

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
	<u>Molitor '751</u>
	Molitor '751 teaches blends comprising Surlyn 1605 (8940), Surlyn 1706 (9910). (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), Table 1.) Each of these materials is less than 16% acid (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having	OFF THE BALL
a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	<u>Molitor '751:</u>
	ON THE BALL
	Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table):

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751		
		Material	Parts
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10
		TiO2	5
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10
		Antioxidant	0.17
		Pigment	0.02
		Release Agent	1
	when n hardnes	neasured on Nesbitt's ball, this covers of hardness of 49.6. (MacKnigh OFF THE BALL neasured off the ball, this formulates of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" averaged 1414 (Ex. 34).)	t Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33). 2 ion had a Shore D
a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)		
		tter layer of the soft resin is of a the '(Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-	
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12, col. 18.)		
	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)		

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.05 inches.	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020

Claim 2	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3,
	lines 19-23.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a thickness of from about 0.03 to about 0.06 inches.	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.) "The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core:	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed about said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10),	
	col. 2, lines 36-38.) Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 54-55.)	
	OFF THE BALL	
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 10), Table 1.)	
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by	
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)	
	ON THE BALL Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)	
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomeric resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)	
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)	
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)	
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)	
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)	

Claim 4	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a "relatively soft polyurethane material." (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)
	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	OFF THE BALL
	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (<i>See</i> CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 5	Nesbitt and Molitor '751		
	Molitor '751:		
	ON	THE BALL	
	Molitor '751 discloses	the following b	olend as the most
	preferred (Molitor '751 Table):	(Ex. 13), col.	7, line 25,
	Mate	erial	Parts
	Texin 480 AR	(now 285)	90
	Surlyn 1605 (1	now 8940)	10
	TiO2		5
	Fluorescent B	rightener	0.10
	Antioxidant		0.17
	Pigment		0.02
	Release Agent	t	1
	When measured on Nes Shore D hardness of ha Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).	,	
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	THE BALL	
	When measured off the	,	
	Shore D hardness of 39		_
	Shore D hardness at AC	. 0131414 (EX	. 34).)

Claim 6	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.05 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 7	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,

Claim 7	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
about 0.06 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 8	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core:	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball
	10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid
	body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in
	the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed on	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer,
said core,	lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly
	flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2,
	lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural
a Shore D hardness of about	modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn ®
60 or more,	marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt, col. 2, lines
	36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated
	Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn® Product Information : Surlyn® 8940
	(formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293
	patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a
	Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See
	"Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than
	plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt
	Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer	Surlyn® 1605 is a low acid ionomeric resin.
comprising an ionomeric resin	Per the '156 Patent:
including no more than 16%	"Type 1605 Surlyn® (Surlyn® 8940) is a sodium ion based low
by weight of an alpha, beta-	acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid)
	acid (less than of equal to 13 weight percent methacryfic acid)

Claim 8	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
unsaturated carboxylic acid	ionomer resin". ('156 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 46-51.)
	Methacrylic acid is an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.
and having a modulus of from	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer disposed	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then
about said inner cover layer,	remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10),
	col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.) "The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Molitor '751:
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 9	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55. (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)

Claim 9	Nesbitt	Nesbitt and Molitor '751		
	Example is a soft hardner 0061579 When mouter compact (MacKr. Molitor)	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).) ON THE BALL When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.) Molitor '751: ON THE BALL Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most		
	preferre	ed (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Tab Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
	Shore D Decl. (E When m Shore D	When measured on Nesbitt's ball, this cover has a Shore D hardness of hardness of 49.6. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33). OFF THE BALL When measured off the ball, this formulation had a Shore D hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" average Shore D hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)		

Claim 10	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.01 to abo	ut low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
0.05 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)

Claim 10	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

Claim 11	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft,
thickness of from about 0.03 to	low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855,
about 0.06 inches.	may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of
	0.0575 inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '637

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)	
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."	
00,	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.	
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
	compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)	
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."	
or more low acid ionomer resins, each containing no	TABLE 6	
more than 16% by weight	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
acid; and	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)	
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less,	- I will dutter they are of both interest and business of the order to	
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex.) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413.)	
	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).	
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)	
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 2	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a
	golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1,
	lines 11-12.)
a core:	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid
	core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner
	layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer
	layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines

	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
	21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositio layer cover had the composition described was used in a golf ball which was de ball, and the other core was used in designated as a 100 compression ball lines 51-55.)	cribed in Table 1. One core signated as a 90 compression a golf ball which was
an inner cover layer disposed about said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf b core 11 and a cover 12 which complayer 13 of one or more ionomer reouter layer 14 of polymeric material. lines 21-24.)	rises a relatively hard inner esins and a relatively soft
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	"The composition of the inner cover 6."	·
	Composition of Inner La (Parts by Weig	ayer of Cover
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 005122 cover blend has a hardness of 60 or r ball, specifically 64.7. (See "Blend 2 (Ex. 34).) "The inner lover can be moded in o	231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this more when measured off the 2" described in AC 0131414
	"The inner layer can be molded in o 1. Injection molded over the core in conventionally used to injection mole	a manner which is
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place ha compression mold the inner cover (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)	
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomeric resins, each	"The composition of the inner cover 6."	layer is described in Table
containing no more than 16%	TABLE 6	
by weight of an alpha, beta-	Composition of Inner La (Parts by Weig	
uncoturated apphayulia aside	Innomes Tune	Blend Ratio
unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Ionomer Type Sodium- Surlyn 8940	75%

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " Proudfit (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).

The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).) Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D	Claim 5	Proudfit and Molitor '637
hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).) ON THE BALL When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)		The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).) Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).) ON THE BALL When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of

Claim 6	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 7	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 8	Proudfit and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls, and more
	particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover."
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core:	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes
	a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a
	relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer
	resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric
	material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new

Claim 8	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
	two-layer cover had the composi	
	One core was used in a golf ball	•
	a 90 compression ball, and the o	
	golf ball which was designated a ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, li	=
	ban. (Flouditt (Ex. 3), col. 7, ii	nes 31-33.)
an inner cover layer disposed on	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece go	olf ball 10 which includes
said core,	a solid core 11 and a cover 12 w	_
	relatively hard inner layer 13 o	
	resins and a relatively soft outer	1 1
gold inner cover lever having a	material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col.	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 60	"The composition of the inner co	over layer is described in
or more,	Table 6."	
,	TABLE (6
	Composition of Inner La (Parts by Weig	
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940	75%
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910	25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-	-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hard	dness of 66; Surlyn®
	9910 has a Shore D hardness of 6	64 (CW 00512231.)
	Therefore, this cover blend has a	
	when measured off the ball, spec	
	"Blend 2" described in AC 01314	
	"The inner layer can be molded i	
	1. Injection molded over the core	
	conventionally used to injection solid core.	moid ionomers over a
		1 10 1 11 4
	2. Injection mold halfshells, plac	
	core, compression mold the inner (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-	
said inner cover layer	"The composition of the inner co	
comprising an ionomeric resin	Table 6."	, to ray or is described ill
including no more than 16% by		,
weight of an alpha, beta-	TABLE (······································
unsaturated carboxylic acid	Composition of Inner La (Parts by Weig	
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-	-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and
	Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid	•

Claim 8	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.) "Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>)
an outer cover layer disposed about said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)

Claim 9	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a
exhibits a Shore D hardness of	blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines
about 64 or less.	15-17.) This material inherently has a Shore D

Claim 9	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	hardness of less than 64.
	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.). The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47)
	has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (See AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane
	is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW
	00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor
	'637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 10	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
has a thickness of from about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.01 to about 0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 11	Proudfit and Molitor '637
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
has a thickness of from about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.03 to about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

PROUDFIT AND WU

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu	
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (col. 1, lines 11-12.)	
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	6."	
	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover	
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 Ex. 34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.	
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)	
said inner cover layer	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu
comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer resins, each containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, betaunsaturated carboxylic acid; and	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25% (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (See '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.). The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC
	0131413 (Ex. 34).) " an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.). Wu
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56 .8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.) OFF THE BALL Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (See AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu
a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 2	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1,
	lines 11-12.)
a core:	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu	
	layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer disposed about said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover	
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%	
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.	
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)	
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomeric resins,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."	
each containing no more	TABLE 6	
than 16% by weight of an	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
alpha, beta-unsaturated	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
carboxylic acid; and	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-	

Claim 4	Proudfit and Wu
	unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Wu Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.). The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).) <u>Wu</u> <u>ON THE BALL</u> Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56.8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 5	Proudfit and Wu
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)

Claim 6	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 7	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 8	Proudfit and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls, and more
	particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover."
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core:	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes
	a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a
	relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer
	resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric
	material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a

Claim 8	Proudfit and Wu	
	relatively hard inner layer 13	
	resins and a relatively soft out material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), co	•
said inner cover layer having a	"The composition of the inner	•
Shore D hardness of about 60	Table 6."	cover layer is described in
or more,		7.6
	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover	
	(Parts by W	eight)
	Ionomer Type Sodium- Surlyn 8940	Blend Ratio
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910	25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D has	ardness of 66; Surlyn®
	9910 has a Shore D hardness o	`
	45).) Therefore, this cover blen	
	more when measured off the ba "Blend 2" described in AC 013	•
	"The inner layer can be molded	d in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the co	
	conventionally used to injection solid core.	n mold ionomers over a
		o o o h olfah olla oyun 4h o
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core."	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 3	
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin	"The composition of the inner Table 6."	cover layer is described in
including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-	TABLI	∃ 6
unsaturated carboxylic acid	Composition of Inner (Parts by W	Layer of Cover
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 2	, ·
	Surlyn® 9910 are both low aci	
	containing no more than 16% the unsaturated carboxylic acid. (S	• •
	8, lines 20-27.)	
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"The standard resins have a frange of about 30,000 to about by ATM Method D-790. (Standard Symbol) in LLS Peters.	at 55,000 psi as measured dard resins are referred to
	as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Pater (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66	
	. , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	

Claim 8	Proudfit and Wu	
	"Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc) " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.) "The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."	
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id</i> .)	
an outer cover layer disposed about said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)	
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)	
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)	
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 12), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)	

Claim 9	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover exhibits a	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a
Shore D hardness of about 64 or	blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex.
less.	5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) This material inherently has a
	Shore D hardness of less than 64.
	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a
	blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines
	15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64.
	(See Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7;

Claim 9	Proudfit and Wu
	Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	Wu
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56.8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl.
	(Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower
	than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex.
	33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D
	hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (See
	AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI
	prepolymer.)

Claim 10	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 11	Proudfit and Wu
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex.

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751			
	5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)			
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more low acid ionomer	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."			
resins, each containing no		TABLE 6		
more than 16% by weight		Composition of Inner Layer of (Parts by Weight)	Cover	-
of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic			Blend Ratio	_
acid; and	_	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%	_
an outer cover layer	low acid of an alg (Ex. 1), "FIG. 1	lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® sometimes of the surface	re than 16% by cid. (See '293 p	weight atent
disposed on said inner cover layer,	core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)			
said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).			
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)			
	Molitor '751:			
		ON THE BALL		
	Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table):			
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751			
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
		neasured on Proudfit's ball, this cos of hardness of 49.6 . (MacKnight		
	hardnes	OFF THE BALL neasured off the ball, this formulations of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" averance 1414 (Ex. 34).)	on had a Shore	
a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	about 0. 1.680 in	ickness of the outer layer can be 0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a tach. The preferred dimensions are ass of 0.0525 inch" (Proudfit (E.	otal ball diamet an outer lay e	er of e r
and comprising a polyurethane material.		outer layer of soft material such as and other elastomers." (Proudfit (
		eferred components of the cover molastic polyurethane " (Molito		

Claim 2	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 1	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to about	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751	
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)	
a core:	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer disposed about said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a	
	Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this	
	cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414	
	(Ex. 34).)	

Claim 4	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is
	conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core,
	compression mold the inner cover over the core. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table
comprising a blend of two	6."
or more ionomeric resins,	TABLE 6
each containing no more	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated	(Parts by Weight)
carboxylic acid; and	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(D. 15) (F. 5) 1.0.1; 22.20)
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-
	unsaturated carboxylic acid. (See '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines
	20-27.)
an outer cover layer disposed	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of
on said inner cover layer,	balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-
	17.)
	"FIC 1 illustrates a true mises calf hall 10 which includes a solid
	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner
	layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft
	outer layer 14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7,
	lines 21-24.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of
from about 0.01 to about	about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer
0.07 inches,	thickness of 0.0525 inch" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-
	46.)
and comprising a	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of
polyurethane material.	balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-
	17.)
	Molitor '751:
	"The preferred components of the cover material comprise a
	thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)
	IIIIes 0-7.)

Claim 5	Proudfi	t and Molitor '751	
The golf ball of claim 4	See abov	ve.	
wherein said outer cover exhibits a	Molitor	<u>'751:</u>	
Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.		ON THE BALL	
		'751 discloses the following bl	
	preferre	d (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table	<u>):</u>
		Material	Parts
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10
		TiO2	5
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10
		Antioxidant	0.17
		Pigment	0.02
		Release Agent	1
	Shore D Decl. (E When m Shore D	heasured on Proudfit's ball, this hardness of hardness of 49.6 . (x. 30) at ¶ 33). OFF THE BALL heasured off the ball, this formular hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin I hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex.	(MacKnight Ilation had a Blend" average

Claim 6	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 7	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 4	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.03 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions

Claim 7	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 8	Proudfit and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls, and more
	particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover."
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core:	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a
	relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer
	resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric
	material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new
	two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1.
	One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as
	a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression
	ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer disposed on	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes
said core,	a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a
	relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer
	resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric
said inner cover layer having a	material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
Shore D hardness of about 60	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
or more,	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn®
	9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex.
	45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i>
	"Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is
	conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the

Claim 8	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	core, compression mold the inner cover over the core." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.) "Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in
	the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.) "The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>)
an outer cover layer disposed about said inner cover layer,	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.01 to about 0.07 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit

Claim 8	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	(Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and comprising a polyurethane material.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)

Claim 9	Proudfi	it and Molitor '751	
The golf ball of claim 8	See abo	ve.	
wherein said outer cover exhibits a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).		
	accordin (Ex. 47) measure Molitor	Ison Ultra Tour Balata Ball, whing to the Proudfit patent (See CV) has a Shore D hardness of lessed on the ball. (See AC 0131413 - '751: ON THE BALL '751 discloses the following bled (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table)	W 0302942-47 s than 64 when 3 (Ex. 45).)
		Material	Parts
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10
		TiO2	5
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10
		Antioxidant	0.17

Claim 9	Proudfit and Molitor '751		
		Release Agent	1
	Shore D	hardness of hardness of 49.6 . (2x. 30) at ¶ 33).	
		OFF THE BALL	
	When m	easured off the ball, this formula	ation had a
	Shore D	hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin B	lend" average
	Shore D	hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex. 3	4).)

Claim 10	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has a	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of from about 0.01 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.05 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

Claim 11	Proudfit and Molitor '751
The golf ball of claim 8	See above.
wherein said outer cover layer has	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
a thickness of from about 0.03 to	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
about 0.06 inches.	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

EXHIBIT D

NESBITT INCORPORATING MOLITOR '637 (OR ALTERNATIVELY IN COMBINATION WITH MOLITOR '637)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." ((Ex. 10),col. 3, lines 19-23.)
said inner cover layer	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
comprising a blend of two or more ionomer resins, at least one of which contains no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 36).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
material,	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more,	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt, col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55.) OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605 (<i>see</i> '293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66. Surlyn® 8940 (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), (Table 1).)
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.) Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
and said outer cover layer	OFF THE BALL
having a Shore D hardness of less than 64.	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (<i>See</i> CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
A multi-layer golf ball	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
comprising:	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having Shore D hardness of at least 60 disposed on said spherical core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1).
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 244:12—244:17.
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	this invention." (Nesbitt, col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637, col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 36).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
and having a modulus of from	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (CW 00615792.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl.

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '637
	(Ex. 25) at ¶ 33.)
	"[T]he outer layer or cover 16 being of dimpled
	configuration " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 48-49; Fig. 2.)
said outer cover layer	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference:
comprising a polyurethane	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of
based material and	Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which
	describes a number of foamable compositions of a character
	which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16."
	(Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including
	"polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic
	polyisocyanates"; specifically Estane 58133 thermoplastic
	polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col.
	18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)
said outer cover layer having	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low
a thickness of from about	flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the
0.010 to about 0.070 inches.	range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col.
	3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

NESBITT AND WU

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex.10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomer resins, at least one of which contains no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.) Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.) Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 38).) Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (See Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 at 16.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane material,	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).) Wu Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more,	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 54-55.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605 (see '293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.) ON THE BALL Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (See Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1). Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than
	plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.) Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
and said outer cover layer	OFF THE BALL
having a Shore D hardness of less than 64.	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Wu
	$\underline{\mathbf{W}}\mathbf{u}$
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the
	ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—
	60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when
	measured "off the ball." (See AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing
	measurements of MDI prepolymer.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Wu
A multi-layer golf ball	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
comprising:	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having Shore D hardness of at least 60 disposed on said spherical core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 54-55.)
	OFF THE BALL
	<u>DuPont Surlyn® Product Information</u> : Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (<i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Wu
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1.) Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (See Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.) Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.) Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).)
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (<i>See</i> Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.) Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus. "Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.) Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55.

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Wu
	(CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	"[T]he outer layer or cover 16 being of dimpled configuration " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 48-49; Fig. 2.) Wu
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 55.6 when measured on Nesbitt's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball the measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (See AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing
	measurements of MDI prepolymer.)
said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material and	Nesbitt Incorporates Materials of Molitor by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658, of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for one or both layers 14 and 16." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54,60.)
	(Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including "polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates"; specifically Estane 58133 thermoplastic polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col. 18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a

Case 1:06-cv-00091-SLR Document 231-1 Filed 08/14/07 Page 150 of 178 PageID #: 6169 Invalidity Charts for U.S. Patent No. 6,595,873

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Wu
	polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll.
	35; claim 1.)
said outer cover layer having	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low
a thickness of from about	flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the
0.010 to about 0.070 inches.	range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575
	inches ." (Nesbitt (Ex 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

NESBITT AND MOLITOR '751

A golf ball comprising:	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making same
	" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"Disposed on the spherical center or core 12 is a first layer, lamination, ply or inner cover 14 of molded hard, highly flexural modulus resinous material" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 34-37.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches,	"It is found that the inner layer of hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as Surlyn® resin type 1605, is preferably of a thickness in a range of 0.020 inches and 0.070 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 19-23.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomer resins, at least one of which contains no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.) Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.) Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 37).) Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (See Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	Molitor '751 teaches blends comprising Surlyn 1605 (8940), Surlyn 1706 (9910). (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), Table 1.) Each of these materials is less than 16% acid (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
an outer cover layer disposed on said inner cover layer,	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10) col. 2, lines 43-47.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches,	"The thickness of the outer layer or cover 16 of soft, low flexural modulus resin such as Surlyn type 1855, may be in the range of 0.020 inches and 0.100 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575 inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)
and said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
material,	"Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)
wherein said golf ball has an overall diameter of 1.680 inches or more,	"According to the United States Golf Association Rules, the minimum diameter prescribed for a golf ball is 1.680 inches" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 50-52.)
	"This center or core 12 and inner layer 14 of hard resinous material in the form of a sphere is then remolded into a dimpled golf ball of a diameter of 1.680 inches minimum with an outer or cover layer 16 of a soft, low flexural modulus resin" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 34-38.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)

Claim 1	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	OFF THE BALL
	DuPont Surlyn Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly 1605 (<i>see</i> '293 patent, col. 2, lines 54-55)) has a Shore D hardness of 66. (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. <i>See</i> Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference:
	Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex 12), Table 1.)
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17. Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
and said outer cover layer	
_	OFF THE BALL
and said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of less than 64.	OFF THE BALL Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
having a Shore D hardness of	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It
having a Shore D hardness of	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference:
having a Shore D hardness of	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
having a Shore D hardness of	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention."
having a Shore D hardness of	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt, col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off
having a Shore D hardness of	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855, now Surlyn® 9020 ('293 patent, col. 2, lines (63-65.) It has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (See CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt, col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)

Claim 1	Nesbitt	and Molitor '751		
	ON THE BALL Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table):			
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
	When measured on Nesbitt's ball, this cover has a Shore D hardness of hardness of 49.6. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33).			
	hardnes	OFF THE B. neasured off the ball, this forms of 39.5 (<i>See</i> "Texin Blend" 1414 (Ex. 34).)	nulation had a	

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
A multi-layer golf ball	"The disclosure embraces a golf ball and method of making
comprising:	same" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), Abstract; FIGS 1 & 2.)
a spherical core;	"Referring to the drawings in detail there is illustrated a golf ball 10 which comprises a solid center or core formed as a solid body of resilient polymeric material or rubber-like material in the shape of a sphere." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 31-34.)
an inner cover layer having Shore D hardness of at least 60 disposed on said spherical core,	Nesbitt: "[I]nner cover 14 of molded hard, high flexural modulus resinous material such as type 1605 Surlyn® marketed by E.I DuPont de Nemours." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 36-38.)
	Per the '293 Patent: "Type 1605 Surlyn® (now designated Surlyn® 8940)." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.)

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	OFF THE BALL DuPont Surlyn® Product Information: Surlyn® 8940 (formerly Surlyn® 1605) has a Shore D hardness of 66. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), Table 1.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers which has a Shore D hardness of 64.3 when measured "off the ball." (See "Blend 3" AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	ON THE BALL
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: Molitor '637 discloses a blend of two ionomers (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), Table 1).
	Measurements of Surlyns made "on the ball" are higher than plaque measurements and would also be above 60. (Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 244:12—244:17.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 14 for the golf ball of
	this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.) Molitor '637: Molitor teaches, in examples 1-7, cover materials including a blend of two ionomer resins: Surlyn 1605 and Surlyn 1557. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 14, line 22 to col. 16, line 34.)
	Type 1605 Surlyn® is now designated Surlyn® 8940. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 54-55.) It has about 15% acid. ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-57.)
	Type 1557 Surlyn is now designated Surlyn 9650. (DUP 000038 (Ex. 36).) It has an acid content of about 11%. (DUP 000132 (Ex. 36).)
	Callaway admits that Nesbitt teaches the use of the ionomer

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	blend found in Molitor '637 in a multi-layer golf ball. (See
	Response to Office Action Mailed February 27, 2007 in
	Reexam. Cont. No. 95/000,120 (Ex. 28) at 16.)
	<u>Molitor '751</u>
	Molitor '751 teaches blends comprising Surlyn 1605 (8940), Surlyn 1706 (9910). (Molitor '751, Table 1.) Each of these materials is less than 16% acid (<i>See</i> '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)
and having a modulus of from	Surlyn® 1605 inherently exhibits the claimed modulus.
about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"Type 1605 Surlyn (Surlyn 8940) is a sodium ion based low acid (less than or equal to 15 weight percent methacrylic acid) ionomer resin having a flexural modulus of about 51,000 psi." ('293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 2, lines 55-59.)
an outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less disposed about said inner	"An outer layer, ply, lamination or cover 16 is then remolded onto the inner ply or layer 14" (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 43-47.)
cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball,	Nesbitt: Nesbitt teaches an outer cover layer made of Surlyn® 1855 (now Surlyn® 9020) that has a Shore D hardness of 55 . (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	Nesbitt Incorporates the Materials of Molitor '637 by
	Reference: "Reference is made to the application Ser. No. 155,658 of Robert P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pat. No. 4,274,637 which describes a number of foamable compositions of a character which may be employed for layers 16 for the golf ball of this invention." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 measured off the ball. (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	When measured on the ball of Nesbitt Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 61.0. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	"[T]he outer layer or cover 16 being of dimpled configuration " (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 2, lines 48-49; Fig. 2.)
	Molitor '751:
	ON THE BALL
	Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most preferred
	The second secon

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '751			
	(Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 7, line 25, Table):			
		Material	Parts	
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90	
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10	
		TiO2	5	
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10	
		Antioxidant	0.17	
		Pigment	0.02	
		Release Agent	1	
said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane	hardnes 33). When m hardnes at AC 0 Nesbitt "Refere	OFF THE BA neasured off the ball, this form s of 39.5 (See "Texin Blend" a 131414 (Ex. 34).) Incorporates Materials of Machine is made to the application of the ball of the policy of the ball.	ALL nulation had a average Shore Molitor by Research Ser. No. 155,	Shore D D hardness ference: 658, of
based material and	describe which n	P. Molitor issued into U.S. Pares a number of foamable company be employed for one or bot (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 54-60.)	oositions of a coth layers 14 a	character
	Molitor '637: Teaches cover materials including "polyurethanes such as are prepared from polyols and organic polyisocyanates"; specifically Estane 58133 thermoplastic polyurethane. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 5, lines 39-41; col. 18, lines 31-59 (examples 16 and 17).)		plastic	
	Molitor Molitor Surlyn these ma	•	ng Surlyn 160 Ex. 13), Table	1.) Each of
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches.	"The th flexural	ickness of the outer layer or modulus resin such as Surlyn f 0.020 inches and 0.100 incl	type 1855, m	ay be in the

Case 1:06-cv-00091-SLR Document 231-1 Filed 08/14/07 Page 158 of 178 PageID #: 6177 Invalidity Charts for U.S. Patent No. 6,595,873

Claim 3	Nesbitt and Molitor '751
	3, lines 22-25.)
	"The outer layer of the soft resin is of a thickness of 0.0575
	inches." (Nesbitt (Ex. 10), col. 3, lines 39-40.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '637

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637	
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)	
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)	
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)	
said inner cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.) "The preferred dimensions are and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)	
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomer resins, at least one of which contains no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid; and	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637
an outer cover layer disposed on said	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which
inner cover layer,	includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which
	comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or
	more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer
	14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7,
said outer cover layer having a	lines 21-24.) "The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
thickness of 0.010 to 0.070 inches,	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total
	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)
and said outer cover layer comprising a	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a
polyurethane material,	blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit
	(Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft
	polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col.
	18.)
wherein said golf ball has an overall	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of
diameter of 1.680 inches or more,	1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch
	(inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer
	thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680
said inner sever lever having a Shore D	inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)
said inner cover layer having a Shore D hardness of at least 60,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
naraness of at least oo,	in Table 6.
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 65; Surlyn®
	9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 and Surlyn® 8940
	has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).)
	Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or
	more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7.
	(See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which
	is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over
	a solid core.

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.) Therefore, this cover blend inherently has a hardness of 60 or more. (<i>See also</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶¶ 8-9.)
and said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of less than 64.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47), has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '637
A multi-layer golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more
	particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ."
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which
	includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '637
an inner cover layer having Shore D	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described
hardness of at least 60 disposed on said spherical core,	in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (<i>See</i> "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	Therefore, this cover blend inherently has a hardness of 60 or more. (<i>See also</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶¶ 8-9.)
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two methods:
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core.
	2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
unsaturated carboxylic acid	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '637
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	"The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.) "Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.)
	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
an outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of about 64 or less disposed	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id</i> .) " an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines
about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi- layer golf ball,	15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 6) at 121:2—121:5.).
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	Molitor '637: Teaches the use of Estane 58133 in Examples 16 and 17. (Molitor '637, col. 18.) Estane is a soft polyurethane material that has a Shore D hardness of 55 as measured "off the ball." (CW 00615792 (Ex. 46).)
	ON THE BALL
	When measured on the ball of Proudfit Molitor '637's outer cover layer has a Shore D hardness of 59.4 . (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '637
	[Proudfit (Ex. 5,)Fig. 1 shows a plurality of dimples]
	Fig. 1
	13 14 ·
said outer cover layer comprising a	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a
polyurethane based material and	blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit
	(Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '637: Estane 58133 is a relatively soft polyurethane material. (Molitor '637 (Ex. 12), col. 18.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the
of from about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches.	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions
menes.	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

PROUDFIT AND WU

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 37-40.) "The preferred dimensions are and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomer resins, at least one of which contains no	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated	(Parts by Weight)
carboxylic acid; and	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (<i>See</i> '293 patent

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu	
	(Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.)	
an outer cover layer disposed on	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which	
said inner cover layer,	includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which	
	comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or	
	more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer	
	14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7,	
	lines 21-24.)	
said outer cover layer having	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the	
a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total	
inches,	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions	
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"	
and said outer seven leven	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)	
and said outer cover layer	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a	
comprising a polyurethane material,	blend of balata and other elastomers. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)	
material,	(Ex. 3), col. 3, lines 13-17.)	
	XX7	
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising	
	a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line	
	10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)	
wherein said golf ball has an	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of	
overall diameter of 1.680 inches	1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch	
or more,	(inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer	
,	thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680	
	inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)	
said inner cover layer having a	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described	
Shore D hardness of at least 60,	in Table 6."	
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover	
	(Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	2370	
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn®	
	9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231	
	(Ex) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of	
	60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically	
	64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex.	
	34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two	
	methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which	
	1. 1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Wu
	is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core. 2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.) Therefore, this cover blend inherently has a hardness of 60 or more. (<i>See also</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶¶ 8-9.)
and said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of less than 64.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.)
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).)
	<u>Wu</u>
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56.8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Wu
A multi-layer golf ball	"This invention relates to golf balls, and more
comprising:	particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ."
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which
	includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which
	comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or
	more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer
	14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7,
	lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the

Claim 3	Proudfit and Wu
	new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer having Shore D hardness of at least 60 disposed on said spherical core,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)
	Therefore, this cover blend inherently has a hardness of 60 or more. (<i>See also</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25)at ¶¶ 8-9.) "The inner layer can be molded in one of two
	methods: 1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core. 2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."

Claim 3	Proudfit and Wu	
	TABLE	2.6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover	
	(Parts by We	eight) Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940	75%
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910	25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 99 ionomer resins containing no weight of an alpha, beta-unsat (See '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8	910 are both low acid more than 16% by curated carboxylic acid.
and having a modulus of from	"The standard resins have a	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
about 15,000 to about 70,000	range of about 30,000 to abo	
psi; and	measured by ATM Method D	_
	are referred to as "hard Surlyr 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5) line 1.)	
	"Specific standard Surlyn re in the inner layer include 894 " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, 1	40 (sodium), 9910 (zinc)
	"The composition of the inne described in Table 6."	er cover layer is
	TABLE	6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)	
	Ionomer Type	Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 Zinc- Surlyn 9910	75% 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines a flexural modulus of 51,000 (45)), while Surlyn 9910 has a 48,000 psi (<i>Id</i> .)	psi (CW 00512231 (Ex.
an outer cover layer having a	" an outer layer of soft ma	
Shore D hardness of about 64 or less disposed about said inner	blend of balata and other elast	` ` `
cover layer and defining a	5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of	
plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball,	25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Tran 121:5.).	,
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata	Ball, which is made
	according to the Proudfit pate	nt (See CW 0302942-47
	(Ex. 47)) has a Shore D hardn	
	measured on the ball. (See AC	しい131413 (EX. 34).)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Wu
	Wu
	ON THE BALL
	Wu's polyurethane has a Shore D hardness of 56.8 when measured on Proudfit's ball. (MacKnight Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33.)
	OFF THE BALL
	Off the ball measurements of polyurethanes are lower than on the ball measurements (Wu Depo. Trans. (Ex. 33) at 60:14—60:24.) This material had a Shore D hardness of 51.6 when measured "off the ball." (<i>See</i> AC0131414 (Ex. 34) showing measurements of MDI prepolymer.)
	[Proudfit (Ex. 5) Fig. 1 shows a plurality of dimples] Fig. 1
	12
said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material and	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Wu discloses a golf ball cover formulation comprising a polyurethane. (Wu (Ex. 8), Table 1; col. 7, line 10—col. 8, ll. 35; claim 1.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches.	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions

Case 1:06-cv-00091-SLR Document 231-1 Filed 08/14/07 Page 171 of 178 PageID #: 6190 Invalidity Charts for U.S. Patent No. 6,595,873

Claim 3	Proudfit and Wu
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch"
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)

PROUDFIT AND MOLITOR '751

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751
A golf ball comprising:	"This invention relates to golf balls , and more particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer disposed on said core,	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24.)
said inner cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.100 to about 0.010 inches,	"The thickness of the inner layer can be within the range of about 0.0250 to 0.2875 inch to provide a total diameter of the inner layer and core within the range of about 1.550 to 1.590 inch." (col. 7, lines 37-40.) "The preferred dimensions are and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-44.)
said inner cover layer comprising a blend of two or more ionomer resins, at least one of which contains no more than 16% by weight of	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight)
an alpha, beta-unsaturated	Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
carboxylic acid; and	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid.
an outer cover layer disposed on	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751	
said inner cover layer,	includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which	
	comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or	
	more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer	
	14 of polymeric material. " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7,	
	lines 21-24.)	
said outer cover layer having	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the	
a thickness of 0.010 to 0.070	range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total	
inches,	ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions	
	are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)	
and said outer gover layer	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a	
and said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane	blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit	
material,	(Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)	
materiar,	(Ex. 3), coi. 3, lines 13 17.)	
	Molitor '751:	
	"The preferred components of the cover material	
	comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane " (Molitor	
	'751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)	
wherein said golf ball has an	"The preferred dimensions are a core diameter of	
overall diameter of 1.680 inches	1.500 inch, and inner layer thickness of 0.037 inch	
or more,	(inner layer diameter of 1.575 inch), and an outer layer	
	thickness of 0.0525 inch (total ball diameter of 1.680	
	inch)." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 43-47.)	
said inner cover layer having a	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described	
Shore D hardness of at least 60,	in Table 6."	
	TABLE 6	
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover	
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio	
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%	
	Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%	
	(D. 16) (E. 5) 1.0.1; 22.20.)	
	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.)	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 65; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64.	
	Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn®	
	9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness	
	of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically	
	64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex.	
	34).)	
	"The inner layer can be molded in one of two	
	methods:	
	1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751	
	is conventionally used to injection mode a solid core. 2. Injection mold halfshells, place half core, compression mold the inner co core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 3 Therefore, this cover blend inherently of 60 or more. (<i>See also</i> Decl. of Edm (Ex. 25) at ¶¶ 8-9.)	Fishells over the ver over the 32-38.) has a hardness
and said outer cover layer having a Shore D hardness of less than 64.	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.).	
	The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, what according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See C</i> (Ex. 47) has a Shore D hardness of less measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 01314) Molitor '751: ON THE BALL Molitor '751 discloses the following be preferred (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table)	CW 0302942-47 as than 64 when 13 (Ex. 34).)
	Material	Parts
	Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90
	Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10
	TiO2	5
	Fluorescent Brightener	0.10
	Antioxidant	0.17
	Pigment	0.02
	Release Agent	1
	When measured on Proudfit's ball, thi Shore D hardness of hardness of 49.6 . Decl. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33). OFF THE BALL	

Claim 1	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	When measured off the ball, this formulation had a Shore D hardness of 39.5 (<i>See</i> "Texin Blend" average Shore D hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).)

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '751
A multi-layer golf ball	"This invention relates to golf balls, and more
comprising:	particularly, to a golf ball having a two-layer cover ."
r	(Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 1, lines 11-12.)
a spherical core;	"FIG. 1 illustrates a two-piece golf ball 10 which includes a solid core 11 and a cover 12 which comprises a relatively hard inner layer 13 of one or more ionomer resins and a relatively soft outer layer 14 of polymeric material." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 21-24; FIGS 1, 2.)
	"Two specific solid core compositions used with the new two-layer cover had the composition described in Table 1. One core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 90 compression ball, and the other core was used in a golf ball which was designated as a 100 compression ball." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 51-55.)
an inner cover layer having Shore D hardness of at least 60 disposed on said spherical core,	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6."
	TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
	(col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 has a Shore D hardness of 66; Surlyn® 9910 has a Shore D hardness of 64 (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45).) Therefore, this cover blend has a hardness of 60 or more when measured off the ball, specifically 64.7. (See "Blend 2" described in AC 0131414 (Ex. 34).) Therefore, this cover blend inherently has a hardness of 60 or more. (See also Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert
	(Ex. 25) at ¶¶ 8-9.) "The inner layer can be molded in one of two

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	methods: 1. Injection molded over the core in a manner which is conventionally used to injection mold ionomers over a solid core. 2. Injection mold halfshells, place halfshells over the core, compression mold the inner cover over the core ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 32-38.)
said inner cover layer comprising an ionomeric resin including no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta- unsaturated carboxylic acid	"The composition of the inner cover layer is described in Table 6." TABLE 6 Composition of Inner Layer of Cover (Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75% Zinc- Surlyn 9910 25%
and having a modulus of from about 15,000 to about 70,000 psi; and	(col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn® 8940 and Surlyn® 9910 are both low acid ionomer resins containing no more than 16% by weight of an alpha, beta-unsaturated carboxylic acid. (See '293 patent (Ex. 1), col. 8, lines 20-27.) "The standard resins have a flexural modulus in the range of about 30,000 to about 55,000 psi as measured by ATM Method D-790. (Standard resins are referred to as "hard Surlyns" in U.S. Patent No. 4,884,814.)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, line 66-col. 6, line 1.) "Specific standard Surlyn resins which can be used in the inner layer include 8940 (sodium), 9910 (zinc)" (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 6, lines 6-7.) "The composition of the inner cover layer is
	described in Table 6." TABLE 6
	Composition of Inner Layer of Cover
an outer cover layer having a	(Parts by Weight) Ionomer Type Blend Ratio
	Sodium- Surlyn 8940 75%
	Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 8, lines 22-30.) Surlyn 8940 has a flexural modulus of 51,000 psi (CW 00512231 (Ex. 45), while Surlyn 9910 has a flexural modulus of 48,000 psi (<i>Id.</i>) " an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a
two to to tay or maxing u	an outer layer of soft material such as valuta of a

Claim 3	Proudfi	it and Molitor '751	
Shore D hardness of about 64 or less disposed about said inner cover layer and defining a plurality of dimples to form a multi-layer golf ball,	blend of balata and other elastomers." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.) Balata has a Shore D hardness of less than 64. (<i>See</i> Decl. of Edmund A. Hebert (Ex. 25) at ¶ 7; Nesbitt Depo. Trans. (Ex. 16) at 121:2—121:5.). The Wilson Ultra Tour Balata Ball, which is made according to the Proudfit patent (<i>See</i> CW 0302942-47 (Ex. 47) has a Shore D hardness of less than 64 when measured on the ball. (<i>See</i> AC 0131413 (Ex. 34).) Molitor '751: ON THE BALL Molitor '751 discloses the following blend as the most		
	preferre	d (Ex. 13, col. 7, line 25, Table)	
		Material	Parts
		Texin 480 AR (now 285)	90
		Surlyn 1605 (now 8940)	10
		TiO2	5
		Fluorescent Brightener	0.10
		Antioxidant	0.17
		Pigment	0.02
		Release Agent	1
	Shore D Decl. (E When m Shore D	neasured on Proudfit's ball, this of hardness of hardness of 49.6. (Ex. 30) at ¶ 33). OFF THE BALL neasured off the ball, this formul 0 hardness of 39.5 (See "Texin B 0 hardness at AC 0131414 (Ex. 3)	MacKnight ation had a lend" average
	[Proud	fit, (Ex. 5)Fig. 1 shows a plurali	ty of dimples]

Claim 3	Proudfit and Molitor '751
	Fig. 1
	13
said outer cover layer comprising a polyurethane based material and	" an outer layer of soft material such as balata or a blend of balata and other elastomers ." (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 5, lines 15-17.)
	Molitor '751: "The preferred components of the cover material comprise a thermoplastic polyurethane" (Molitor '751 (Ex. 13), col. 3, lines 6-7.)
said outer cover layer having a thickness of from about 0.010 to about 0.070 inches.	"The thickness of the outer layer can be within the range of about 0.0450 to 0.0650 inch to provide a total ball diameter of 1.680 inch. The preferred dimensions are an outer layer thickness of 0.0525 inch " (Proudfit (Ex. 5), col. 7, lines 40-46.)